

# Ensemble Learning for Reectometry

Fabiano Romeiro

and Todd  
Zickler

TR-06-10

Computer Science Group  
Harvard University  
Cambridge, Massachusetts

T  
e  
c  
h  
n  
i  
c  
a  
l  
r  
e  
p  
o  
r  
t

a  
c  
c  
o  
m  
p  
a  
n  
y  
i  
n  
g

\  
B  
l  
i  
n  
d

R  
e  
e  
c  
t  
o  
m  
e  
t  
r  
y  
"

,

i  
n

P  
r  
o  
c  
.

E  
u  
r  
o  
p  
e  
a  
n  
C  
o

n  
f  
e  
r  
e  
n  
c  
e  
  
o  
n  
  
C  
o  
m  
p  
u  
t  
e  
r  
  
V  
i  
s  
i  
o  
n  
,

2  
0  
1  
0  
.

E  
n  
s  
e  
m  
b  
l  
e

L  
e  
a  
r  
n  
i  
n  
g

f  
o  
r

R  
e  
e  
c  
t  
o  
m  
e  
t  
r  
y

F  
a  
b  
i  
a  
n  
o

R  
o  
m  
e  
i  
r  
o

a  
n  
d

T  
o  
d  
d

Z  
i  
c  
k  
l  
e  
r

H

a  
r  
v  
a  
r  
d

U  
n  
i  
v  
e  
r  
s

i  
t  
y

3  
3

O  
x  
f  
o  
r  
d

S  
t  
. ,

C  
a  
m  
b  
r  
i  
d  
g  
e  
,

M  
A  
,

U  
S  
A  
,

0  
2  
1  
3  
8

{  
r  
o  
m  
e  
i  
r  
o  
,

z  
i  
c  
k  
l  
e  
r  
} @  
s  
e  
a  
s  
. h  
a  
r

v  
a  
r  
d  
·  
e  
d  
u

A  
b  
s  
t  
r  
a  
c  
t  
·

I  
n

\B  
l  
i  
n  
d

R  
e  
e  
c  
t  
o  
m  
e  
t  
r  
y

(  
R  
o  
m  
e  
i  
r  
o

a  
n  
d

Z  
i  
c  
k  
l  
e  
r

2  
0  
1  
0

[  
3  
])

w  
e

d  
e  
s  
c  
r  
i  
b  
e

a

v  
a  
r  
i  
a  
t  
i  
o  
n  
a  
l

B  
a  
y  
e  
s  
i  
a  
n

a  
p  
p  
r  
o  
a  
c  
h

t  
o

i  
n  
f  
e  
r  
r  
i  
n  
g

m  
a  
t  
e  
r  
i  
a  
l

proper  
ties

(  
B  
R  
D  
F  
)

fr  
om

a

si  
n  
g  
l  
e

i  
m  
a  
g  
e

o  
f

a

k  
n  
o  
w  
n

s  
h  
a  
p  
e

u  
n  
d  
e  
r

u  
n  
k  
n  
o  
w  
n

,

r

e  
a  
l  
w  
o  
r  
l  
d

i  
l  
l  
u  
m  
i  
n  
a  
t  
i  
o  
n  
.

T  
h  
i  
s  
t  
e  
c  
h  
n  
i  
c  
a  
l  
r  
e  
p  
o  
r  
t

p  
r  
o  
v  
i  
d  
e  
s

a  
d  
d  
i  
t  
i  
o  
n  
a  
l

d  
e  
t  
a  
i  
l

s  
o  
f  
t  
h  
a  
t  
a  
p  
p  
r  
o  
a  
c  
h  
.

F  
i  
r  
s  
t  
,

w  
e

d  
e  
t  
a  
i  
l

t  
h  
e

p  
r  
i  
o  
r

p  
r  
o  
b  
a  
b  
i  
l  
i  
t  
y

d  
i  
s  
t  
r  
i  
b  
u  
t  
i  
o  
n

for  
natural

lighting

environments.

Second,

we

provide

a

derivation

of

the binomial likelihood expression that is based on discretizing the re

ndering  
equation.

Third  
and

nally,

we

provide

the

update

equations

for

the  
iterative

algorithm

that

computes

a

approximation

to  
the

posteriori

r  
d  
i  
s  
t  
r  
i  
b  
u  
t  
i  
o  
n

o  
f

B  
R  
D  
F  
s  
.

1  
III  
u  
m  
in

ob  
 ab  
 ilit  
 y  
 di  
 str  
 ib  
 uti  
 on  
 on  
 th  
 e  
 w  
 av  
 el  
 et  
 co  
 e  
 ci  
 en  
 ts  
 of  
 re  
 al-  
 w  
 orl  
 d  
 ill  
 u  
 mi  
 na  
 tio  
 n  
 en  
 vir  
 on  
 m  
 en  
 ts  
 is  
 of  
 th  
 e  
 for  
 m  
 $p(') = \sum_{m=1}^M p_{nm} X_n^{NM}$ ; (1)

with  $N_m$  the number of mixture components for coefficient  $m$ , and  $p_{nm}$  the mixing weights.

All coefficients in any one group (defined in Sect. 3.1 [3]) share the same

$N_m$ ,  $p_{nm}$  and  $p_{nmm}$ . The exact forms of the mixture components are as follows:

$$\begin{aligned}
 p_{nm} & (N(0; v); \text{if } m6= 3 N_{RCnm}( 'nm; v_{nm}; T); \text{if } m= 3 ; (2) \\
 v_{nm} & = 8 >v< :nr( ; \text{if } r(m) 2f2;3g v_{nr(m)}; \text{ if } r(m) 2f4;5g \\
 & \quad m) g(m) \quad v_{nm}; \text{ otherwise and } N_m & = 8 >r(m); \text{ if } r(m) 2f3;4;5g 2; \\
 & \quad \text{if } r(m) 2f1;2g; m6= 3 1; \text{ if } \\
 & \quad m= 3 <: ;
 \end{aligned}$$

w  
 he  
 re  
 m  
 =  
 3  
 is  
 th  
 e  
 w

av  
el  
et  
co  
e  
ci  
en  
t  
co  
rr  
es  
po  
nd  
in  
g  
to  
th  
e  
ve  
rti  
ca  
l  
ba  
si  
s  
el  
e  
m  
en  
t  
at  
th  
e  
co  
ar  
se  
st  
sc  
al  
e,  
r(  
m)  
in  
di  
ca  
te  
s  
th  
e  
sc  
al  
e  
of  
co  
e  
ci  
en  
t  
m,  
an  
d  
g(  
m)  
in

di  
ca  
te  
s  
to  
w  
hi  
ch  
gr  
ou  
pi  
ng  
(s  
pa  
tia  
I  
lo  
ca  
tio  
n  
an  
d  
ba  
si  
s  
el  
e  
m  
en  
t  
ty  
pe  
)  
co  
e  
ci  
en  
t  
m  
be  
lo  
ng  
s

## 2 Ensemble Learning for Reectometry

to (see Fig. 2 in [3]).  $N_{RC}$  corresponds to a Gaussian distribution rectified at a given point.  
 $x \sim N_{RC}$  Letting the rectification point be, say, the rectified Gaussian distribution has the form  $(u; w; T)$   
 $\Pr(x) = \frac{1}{\sqrt{2\pi}} \exp(-\frac{(x-u)^2}{2w^2})$  if  $x \geq u$ ; otherwise and it is related to the "standard" rectified Gaussian distribution by  $x \sim N(u; w) \Rightarrow x \sim N_{RC}(3)(u; w; 0)$ : (4)

Furthermore, if  $x \sim N_{RC}(u; w; T)$ , then

$$= u + p_2 w \operatorname{erfc}((uT))$$

$$h_{xi}(p(x)) = \frac{p}{p_2 w} \left( \frac{p}{p_2 w} - \frac{i}{i} \right) r_i(\mathbf{l}) F_i(\mathbf{l})(\mathbf{n}) m \frac{!d!}{!d!} + ; (5)$$

$$)$$

$$\mathbf{P}_{\mathbf{f}} = \frac{\mathbf{F}}{\mathbf{f}}$$

$i = uhxi + w + T(hxi);$  where  $h$  represents the expectation under distribution  $p(\cdot)$ .

## 2 Discrete rendering equation

We define the following imaging model (Eq. 7 in [3]):

$$I = Z L(\mathbf{l}) V \quad r(\mathbf{l}) \text{ and } F_i(\mathbf{l}) = \frac{P}{r}$$

$$i = \sum_{i=1}^{k_k} \sum_{r_1=r_2=r_3}^{r_1=r_2=r_3} i(\mathbf{l}) F_i(\mathbf{l}) \left( \frac{(R_i)}{n_i} \right) (R_i)_{r_1} (W - f(r_2(v_i))) (\mathbf{l}) V L$$

$$Z = \sum_{i=1}^{r_1=r_2=r_3} i(\mathbf{l}) d! r_1(\mathbf{l}) r_2(\mathbf{l}) r_3(\mathbf{l}) (n_i) \sum_{r_1=r_2=r_3}^{r_1=r_2=r_3} i(\mathbf{l}) r_1(\mathbf{l}) r_2(\mathbf{l}) r_3(\mathbf{l}) (v_i) L$$

$$(v)$$

0, otherwise  
 $w \cdot L \cdot V$

$D = (R)$  (being the noise, exposure, local lighting, local visibility, and reectance, respectively. Given linear lighting and reectance representations,  $L = P$  and  $F =$ , we can write  $L_i(\mathbf{l}) = P(\mathbf{l})$ , where  $f(\mathbf{l})$  is the delta basis in a discretized local hemisphere (a discretization of in Eq. 5),  $R$  is the linear transformation that maps from the wavelet basis in domain of the octahedral map into the delta

basis in  $D$  (see [4]), and  $W$  is the linear transformation that maps from the NMF basis into the delta basis in  $D$ . We also represent the visibility in the delta basis in the discrete hemisphere ( $V(1)$   $P(1)$ ), and substitute these into the rendering equation:  $\int d\Omega$

$X$

$$(R^i)^T (W_i f) r(v_i) r(C_r); \quad (7)$$

w             $L_i(\cdot) V_i(\cdot) F_i(\cdot)(n_i$   
 h             $(\cdot)$ . Thus,  $\cdot$  is the support of  $r_i$   
 e             $Z_i(\cdot) d_i X$

Ensemble Learning for Reectometry 3

r  
e

D

r

1

which can be written in matrix form as  $'T M_i f$ , where the per-pixel matrices  $M_i$   
 $= R^T i$        $i \text{ diag}(C v_i) W_i \quad M_i = k_i w_i$ ; (9)

$= 'T$   
 $,$  where  $\cdot$  is the Hadamard (or entrywise) product, and  $\text{diag}(\cdot)$  is a square matrix  
 given by  $M_i$  with its argument along the diagonal. Substituting this expression into Eq. 5, we  
 have

$$f + \cdot; \quad (8) \text{ which is exactly Eq. 8 in [3].}$$

### 3 Update equations for the posterior approximation

As mentioned in Sect. 3.4 of [3], the ensemble of distributions  $q(\cdot)$  that  
 approximate the posterior distribution of reectance  $f$ , lighting  $'$ , and exposure  
 and noise parameters  $\cdot$  are of the forms

$m('m);$  with  $q$        $m \sim N(u_m)$  if  $m=3$   $N \sim w(u; w$   
 $); (11) q('2) \sim (\cdot; a_p; b_p); (12)$  where  $N$  corresponds to a Gaussian distribution  
 rectified at 0 and  $N$  corresponds to a Gaussian distribution rectified at  $T$  (see  
 Eq. 3 above). The closedform expressions for the updated parameters of  
 each approximating distribution in terms of the current parameters of the  
 others (Algorithm 1 in [3]) are as follows. In these expressions, the notation  
 $M_{imk}$  refers to the  $m$ th  $R$  element of matrix  $M_i$ .

$$R C = k; \quad (13)$$

$$\underline{q}(f) = \underline{Y} \underline{q}('N) \underline{k}(f_k); \text{ with } q_k \sim N(u_k - \overline{u}_m; T) \text{ otherwise, (10)}$$

$$R = 22 q('2) X = k_i$$

— — — — —

$$U_k = * (m X - m M_i - m k)^2 + \frac{2}{q(')}; \quad (14)$$

$$T = i^T M f \quad ; \quad (15)$$

2

$$= 2 = q(2$$

$$u_w = 2 q(2) \sum_{i=1}^2 X^{2i} q(';f)$$

$$M_f \quad ; \quad (16)$$

#### 4 Ensemble Learning for Reectometry

$$= 22 q(2) \sum_{i=1}^N X_{mi} + N_m X_{n,m} \quad ; (17)$$

Um

$$W_m = \frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} X_{mi} \quad ; (18)$$

$$0 @= 2 \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} X_{mi} \quad ; (21)$$

i1 A X

$$\frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} q(i) \quad ; (22)$$

$$a_p = \frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} q(i) \quad ; (19)$$

$$\sum_{i=1}^{N_m} q(i) \quad ; (20)$$

with,

$$= \frac{1}{N_m}$$

$$C_i^k = \frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} q(i) \quad ; (21)$$

$$E^{mi} = \frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} q(i) \quad ; (22)$$

$$p_{nm} = \exp(hlog(p_{nm})) \quad ; (23)$$

which corresponds to the vector f with its k entry removed. Simplified expressions for some of these expectations and formulas are in

Sect. 5 below. But first, in order to provide some examples, the next section includes derivations of the parametric forms of two of the ensemble distributions ( $q_k(f)$  and  $q()$ ) as well as the update equations for their respective parameters ( $u_{kk}, w_k$  and  $u, w$ ) listed above.

3.1 Parametric form and update equations for  $q_k(f_k)$  Following Miskin [1] and Miskin and MacKay [2], we find the form of the ensemble distribution  $q_k(f_k)$ , by taking the variational derivative of C with respect to  $q_k$ ,  $dC_{KL} = \log q_k(f_k) - \log p_k(f_k)$

$$+ 22 q(2) \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} X_{mi} \quad ; (25)$$

where  $m$  are such that  $\sum_{m=1}^{N_m} p_{nm} = 1$ , and the notation  $f$

$$+ 1 \quad ; (26)$$

which, when set to zero, leads to

$$q() = \frac{1}{N_m} \sum_{i=1}^{N_m} X_{mi} \quad ; (27)$$

En  
se  
m  
bl  
e  
Le  
ar  
ni  
ng  
for  
Re  
ec  
to  
m  
etr  
y  
5

( $\tau M_i f_i$ )<sup>2</sup> We can now expand the summand,  $q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$

$$= q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$$

$$= q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$$

$$= q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$$

$dC_{KLkL} dq() = \log(q) \log(p)$  with respect to  $q()$  we obtain (28)

$$= q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$$

$$= q(-l_i - m + X 'm M_{im} f_k) + \dots$$

$k(f_k) / p_k(f_k) \exp$

+  
:::  
an  
d  
su  
bs  
tit  
ut  
e

thi  
s  
int  
o  
th  
e  
ex  
pr  
es  
si  
on  
for

q

2

$\sum_{k=1}^N \frac{X^{kif}}{k! f_k}$

Substituting  $p_k(f_k)$  into this expression, we finally arrive at

q

$\exp \left( \sum_{k=1}^N \frac{q_k}{k! f_k} \right) = \exp \left( \sum_{k=1}^N \frac{B_{ki} f_{2k}}{k! f_k} + \sum_{k=1}^N \frac{C_{ki} f_{2k}}{k! f_k} \right)$

= 0

othe  
rwis  
e.

After

com

pleti

ng

the

squa

res,

this

last

equ

ation

lead

s to

quar

as

de n

ed in

Eqs.

132

3.  
2  
P  
a  
r  
a  
m  
e  
t  
r  
i  
c  
f  
o  
r  
m

a  
n  
d  
u  
p  
d  
a  
t  
e  
e  
q  
u  
a  
t  
i  
o  
n  
s  
f  
o  
r  
q  
(  
)  
T  
a  
k  
i  
n  
g  
t  
h  
e  
v  
a  
r  
i  
a  
t  
i  
o  
n  
a  
l  
d  
e  
r  
i  
v  
a  
t  
i  
v

e  
o  
f  
C  
+  
1  
+  
;  
(3  
0)  
(3  
1)  
which, when set to zero, leads to  
 $q() / p() \exp^{-22 q(-z)}$

$$\text{Ni=} \quad ('T - Mifli)2 q(';f)! : \\ _1X$$

6  
En  
se  
m  
bl  
e  
Le  
ar  
ni  
ng  
for  
Re  
ec  
to  
m  
etr  
y

$$f_2 = q(f) - \frac{2l_i}{\sum_{i=1}^n M_i} q(f)$$

$$i_2^{22}$$

q() /p()exp  
+  
:::  
=  
G  
+  
H  
+  
:::  
an  
d  
su  
bs  
tit  
ut  
e  
int  
o  
th  
e  
ex  
pr  
es  
si  
on  
for  
q(  
)

to  
ob  
tai  
n

)  
q(

N  
(Gi2  
+ Hi) ! : (32)

As before, we expand = \*0 @= ('s6=k Xn Mi mfs  
XTr Mi  
li m+ 'm Mi m k f k1 A2+q(';fk)

('T Mifli)2 q(';f)

R(  
u;  
w)

,

w

he

re

u;

w

Th

en

,

as

be

for

e,

w

e

su

bs

tit

ut

e

th

e

ex

pr

es

si

on

for

p(

),

re

ar

ra

ng

e

ter

m

s

an

d

co

m

pl

et

e

th

e

sq

ua

re

s

to  
ar  
riv  
e  
at  
q(  
)  
N  
ar  
e  
as  
de  
n  
ed  
in  
E  
qs  
.

13  
-2  
3.

#### 4 Cost function $C_{KL}$ in Algorithm 1

To derive the expression for the cost function  $C_{KL}$  in Algorithm 1 of [3] we follow Miskin [1] and Miskin and MacKay [2] to approximate some of the terms in Eq. 11 of [3] with their upper bound. This allows us to re-write this expression as

$$m(\cdot) i \quad (34)$$

$$\begin{aligned} & M X_m \\ & = 2 M X \\ & m=2M \\ & X_{m=2} \\ & 1 2 \log 2 w_m 2w_1 \left( \frac{m}{m} u^{\frac{q}{m}} \right)^{\frac{m}{m}} \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} C_{KL} &= C_{KL} + C_{KL} + C_{KL} + C_{KL} \text{KL} \langle \log p(D_j) \rangle \\ C_{KL} &= h \log q_m(\cdot) i q_m(\cdot) h \log p_m(\cdot) q_m(\cdot) \\ & n m \log n m + m \log n m + h \log p_{nm}(\cdot) i \end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned} C_{KL}^{(f)} &= h \log q(f_k) i q_k(f_k) h \log p_k(f_k) i \quad (35) \\ & = 1 2 \log 2 w_k 12 w_k \left( f_k u_k \right)^{\frac{q}{k}} \end{aligned}$$

$kX$   
 $k=1$   
 $kX$   
 $k=1$   
 $kX$   
 $k=1$

C  
(  
)

## Ensemble Learning for Reectometry 7

2

<sup>2</sup>  
)

K  
L

$$= \log(2) \log \frac{p}{(b)(b_p)} + \log \frac{p}{b} - \frac{q(-2)2}{p} q(-2) + \frac{(aa)}{2} - \frac{(36)}{2}$$

a hlog(Dj) iq()

$$N = N2 \log 2 + \frac{q(-2)}{2} \quad (38)$$

$$12_2 \quad \frac{q(-2) hlog(p) iq() 12w(u)}{TM_i} \log \frac{f}{q('f)} + hiq()$$

= hlogq() iq() 1  
2log2 w

$$C_{KL} \quad Ni=1 X \quad fli2 )2 - \quad -$$

### 5 Simplified expressions for Eqs. 13-23

$$* (mX'mMimk)2 + q(') = (2^2 h'i)^T M(2) i(:,k) + (h'i^T M_{i(:,k)})2;$$

$$kXMi_{mk}f k!2 + q(') = M(2) i(:,k) (f 2 hfi) + (M_{i(m,:)}^T Mi hfi) : 2 i(:,k)$$

T

$$\text{cov}(') Mi_i$$

Cki

$$i - 2) T - Ti$$

$$i hiM_k^2 hfi + 2 h'i^T m^th Mi^r o^th ) M_T i$$

. th

i

(k,:)

E  
mi

where the notation  $X_{(2)} = (h'i)$  corresponds to the matrix or vector whose entries are the squares of the entries of  $X$ ,  $M$  refers to the  $k$  column of matrix  $M$ , and  $M$  row. \*

$(TMif)2 q('f) = M\text{cov}(f)Mhfi + h'i^T h'i + (' h'i^T \text{diagv}(M\text{cov}(f))M)$ ; where  $\text{diagv}(X)$  corresponds to a vector whose entries are the diagonal entries

$$Thih'i - M_{i(:,k)} + 2 hfi - M_T i \quad (\text{cov}(') + h'i^T) M_{(m,:)}$$

$$----- (m,:)$$

i

(k,:)

2 = I

of matrix  $X$ . 2 = I

; where t he

X corresponds to the vector X with its k-th column removed, M refers to the matrix formed by removing the k-th column of M, and M' is the matrix formed by removing its k-th column.

$$\begin{aligned} & \left( \begin{array}{c:c} \vdots & \vdots \\ \vdots & \vdots \end{array} \right) \\ & v(f) \\ & + \\ & h_f \end{aligned}$$

## 8 Ensemble Learning for Reectometry

### References

- 1.Miskin, J.: Ensemble Learning for Independent Component Analysis. Ph.D. thesis, University of Cambridge (2000)
- 2.Miskin, J., MacKay, D.: Ensemble learning for blind source separation. Independent Component Analysis: Principles and Practice (2001)
- 3.Romeiro, F., Zickler, T.: Blind reectometry. In: Proc. European Conf. Computer Vision (2010)
- 4.Wang, R., Ng, R., Luebke, D., Humphreys, G.: Efficient wavelet rotation for environment map rendering. In: Eurographics Symposium on Rendering (2006)